



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: September 25, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
5:30 p.m.

ATTENDING: David Morton, Acting-Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate Peter Dimond, Member
See Attendance List Katy Hax Holmes, Staff

ABSENT: Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jeff Templar, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Chairman. Voting permanent members were Morton, Grissom, Fulkerson, Armstrong, and Dimond. Alternate member Sherman also voted. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

Due to this NHC hearing being held on the second night of Rosh Hashanah, which reduced the number of abutters who would attend, the Newton Historical Commission voted at the beginning of this hearing to hear only the agenda items that were due to time out between this hearing and two weeks from this date. All other applications were moved to a newly scheduled hearing on October 14, 2014. Eight items were heard at this hearing. The application for 11 Ruane Road was heard later in the evening because the owners were not in attendance at the beginning of the hearing. When the owners did arrive, they asked for the application to be heard because the provisional P&S for the purchase of this house was to expire on October 6th. The Chairman asked the owner if he chose to waive the abutter's opportunity to hear their application, and he agreed.

Grissom made a motion to hear applications that would time-out between this hearing and two weeks from this meeting, and to hear the remaining applications from the September 2014 agenda at a newly scheduled hearing on October 14th, 2014 at 5:30 pm. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to hear applications that would time-out between this hearing and two weeks from this meeting, and to hear the remaining applications from the September 2014 agenda at a newly scheduled hearing on October 14th, 2014 at 5:30 pm.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

76 Paulson Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

David Silverstein and his attorney, Kenneth Krems, presented their plan to demolish this house. The applicant brought color graphics to show the styles of houses in the neighborhood surrounding this house, as well as houses that were demolished and replaced with new houses. Mr. Krems argued that this house did not meet the minimum standard for historical significance.

Staff reported that a 1936 building permit for the house was filed with Inspectional Services. Built by New England Homes Inc, and designed by Peter A. Caporale of Watertown, this Garrison Colonial house is an early example of this style, located in a neighborhood of houses built in the same period and in similar style. At the time of its construction, the house had an attached rear porch and side garage. In 1955, the owner was Harriet D. Nussenbaum when a rear porch was added behind the first. In 1990, the owner, Mark Durschlag, obtained a permit to build a rear kitchen and porch addition. There has been little new development in this neighborhood over time. As such, staff recommended this house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

A Commission member stated he believed an argument for historic context could be made for this house, and that he believed the Planning Dept thought so as well, even though the staff report cited architectural similarity rather than context. Staff agreed. The Chairman stated that he thought there was historic context and that the scale and style of this house was what the NHC was tasked with preserving in accordance with its ordinance.

Fulkerson made a motion to find the house at 76 Paulson Road preferably preserved for historic context. Sherman seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 76 Paulson Road **preferably preserved** for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman
Nancy Grissom, Member

Jean Fulkerson, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

15 South Gate Park – Demolition Review

Request to demolish building

Tony Depasquale, owner of this building, told the Commission he was inclined to save the building and convert it to housing but that he wanted to keep his options open and continue with his proposal to have the building found not preferably preserved by the NHC.

Staff reported that the building was first constructed as the North Gate Men's Club c.1900, and that historic atlases show this building on land owned by the estate of Edward Howard. In 1917 the building was still known as North Gate, but by 1929 the building was owned by the Odd Fellows Building Association, a group founded on the principal of aiding one's fellow man, which in the 17th century when this idea took root, was considered "odd." The Odd Fellows still owned the building through at least 1953. By 1963 the building was owned by the Knights of Columbus, who continued to own it until well into the 1980s.

A c.1910 postcard image of the original building was found in the Jackson Homestead archives, and shows that much of the original structure is intact from the exterior. The building shows evidence of its Shingle Style design in the stone foundation, massing and asymmetrical design, with the only major modern intrusion being the c.1970 enclosed front entrance. Development of housing in North Gate and South Gate Roads behind this building began c.1910, with South Gate developed sooner. Staff recommended this building preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Two abutters in attendance wanted to hear what the future plans were for the building. They were: Liz Tavares at 29-31 South Gate Park, and Susanne McEnerny of 28-30 South Gate Park. The latter abutter said she wanted to see the building kept and improved. Commission members agreed that the building could and should be saved.

Grissom made a motion to find the house at 15 South Gate Park **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0

RESOLVED to find the house at 15 South Gate Park **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Chairman		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Peter Dimond, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Len Sherman, Alternate		

32-34 Winchester Road

Request to demolish house

John Sambucci of City Point Development and Alan Taylor came to present their plan to demolish the house and build a new two-family building in keeping with the existing zoning.

Staff reported that building permits from 1924 were found for this house and a detached two-car garage in Inspectional Services. Built as a two-family, this house was designed by architect A.H. Hanson of Boston, and was first owned by Hilda E. Steeves of Arlington Heights (her husband a service manager in Somerville), and Anna M. Gustafson, originally of Bridges Avenue in Newtonville (married to a chauffeur). By 1956, the house was owned by Everett Corkum, and in 1973, William Proia. Few permits have been pulled for work at the house over time. This Modern Traditional house shows classic 1920s architectural details such as the blocky footprint, hipped roof, three bay upper story with a two-bay first story; small narrow entrance with open gabled portico; and lack of detail found elsewhere on the structure. This house is also located in a neighborhood of homes constructed in the early to mid-1920s. Staff therefore recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

An abutter at 19 Salisbury, Isabelle Thacker, said she was opposed to the demolition and cited development on Salisbury as poorly done and wanted to keep the scale and integrity of what remained of the neighborhood. Lois Tarmon of 39 Winchester Road said she was worried about traffic safety and visibility issues around this corner. Dian Lee of 38 Winchester Road said she thought the house was old and really outdated, and was fine with either renovation or demolition. She also said the scale of the proposed building was important. Jean De Benedictus, 39 Winchester, also thought the house was unattractive but wanted to see what would replace it. Strom Thacker, 18 Salisbury Road, said he

thought this was an intact neighborhood and that it was already scaled to this house. Isabel Albeck said she thought the visual effects of the windows should be preserved.

Sherman made a motion to find the house at 32-34 Winchester Road **preferably preserved** for historic context and neighborhood support of its preservation. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house at 32-34 Winchester Road **preferably preserved** for historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Chairman
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

51 Bernard Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner of this house was not present (staff was previously notified) and a letter from the owner was read into the record by staff. The letter provided medical and financial reasons for selling the house, and outlined the structural and design deficiencies inherent in the structure.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1935 and designed by architect J.J. Hamon of Brookline. John A. and Margaret Oberlander (assembler in Somerville) were the first owners. In 1943, Margaret Oberlander obtained a permit to enclose the rear porch with wood and glass. By 1949, George, a mechanic, and Jean Anderson owned the house and removed the rear porch and extended the foundation six feet to add two bedrooms. Few other permits were pulled for work to this house. This Cottage Style house is one of at least three remaining on this street, built originally as bucolic, river-front cottages in the 1930s. This house was built on land subdivided from the Neil McIntosh Trust, which owned a great deal of land located between the Charles River and the country club property. This house retains its massing, small proportions, log construction and cottage design, and as such staff recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Discussion ensued as to the value of this house specifically and in the neighborhood generally. The log sheathing on the house was deemed to be a 'folly' not a style, and that the river-front cottages were likely built to be just that. There was also agreement that the neighborhood was in transition.

Sherman made a motion to find the house at 51 Bernard Street **not preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house at 51 Bernard Street **not preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Chairman
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member

Len Sherman, Alternate

144 Nehoiden Street – Demolition Review

Request to demolish garage

The builder and architect, Ralph Kilfoil, for the owner, Philip Haughey, presented the owner's plans to demolish the existing garage and build a new larger detached garage at the same location. The owner considered shoring up the inside of the existing garage and adding to it, but decided instead to remove the whole building. The architect said he did not believe the garage was prominent on the site and was not worth preserving, and that the new owners of the property were planning to move in by December of this year.

Staff reported that though we don't often send garages to the NHC for review, this garage is architecturally consistent with the house in both age and appearance. The Inspectional Services file for this property shows a plumbing permit for this property dating 1917. There was an outbuilding at this location shown on atlases in 1917 and 1929 (but not 1907), owned by Anna D. Whitman. There is a house at this location in 1907, which would suggest the garage was built about ten years later. There is no building permit for this garage in the ISD file. However, given the garage appears to be architecturally compatible with the existing house, staff recommended the garage preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members discussed the merits of the garage and said that it fit the streetscape and matched the design of the house perfectly.

Sherman made a motion to find the house at 144 Nehoiden Street **not preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-4,

RESOLVED to find the garage at 144 Nehoiden Street **not preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

	Dave Morton, Chairman	
	Nancy Grissom, Member	
	Jean Fulkerson, Member	

Peter Dimond, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Len Sherman, Alternate

The motion did not pass, so the garage is preferably preserved.

5 Pine Grove Avenue

Request to demolish house

The architect for the owners, Michael Huller, presented the owners' plans to remove the second floor and roof of the house and garage, and build a full second story on the house. Mr. Huller said that if the house had been maintained it would likely be worth saving as is, but changes over time compromised the integrity of the house. Michael and Natalia Vashevko, owners, have lived in the house since 1998 and spoke to their need to make improvements.

Staff reported that this 1948 Cape Style house is located in Lower Falls at the corner of Pine Grove and Grove Street. Built as a classic Cape, the house now has a single-car attached garage on the left side and an attached porch on the other, approved the same year as the house. M.A. Bouzan of Dorchester was the architect. The house was first owned by the builder and his wife, Alice May Doxey. Robert A. Moore, of Babson's Reports, owned the house in 1953. Kenneth Spilman, a division manager at Sears, owned the house in 1968, and in 1984 the house was owned by Robert B. Webber. This house is a notable pre-war example of Cape

architecture in a neighborhood of houses from the same period. Staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members discussed the fact that this house was in a very prominent site, very visible and was comparable in scale to the houses around it.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 5 Pine Grove Avenue **preferably preserved** for historic context. Sherman seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house at 5 Pine Grove Avenue **preferably preserved** for historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Chairman		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Peter Dimond, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Len Sherman, Alternate		

Commission members reviewed the proposed plans for the partial demolition proposal. Mr. Huller presented the owner's plans to retain the existing footprint and a shingled façade, with a horizontal-board first story and 2/2 windows. They also wanted to add a larger bank of windows on the upper left corner that would overlook the park. The proposed plan was rectangular, with architectural elements emulating the surrounding architecture. The second floor would have no attic or dormers and stay low to the ground, and would be smaller than the house next door. Commission members thanked the owners and architect for a quality presentation and appreciated the architect's efforts to respect the scale of the overall neighborhood and surrounding houses.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay at 5 Pine Grove Avenue. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find waive the demo delay at 5 Pine Grove Avenue based on plans approved at the hearing.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Chairman		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Peter Dimond, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Len Sherman, Alternate		

197 Evelyn Road – Partial Demolition Review

Request to remove roof

Jason Kurtz, architect for the owner, Timothy D'Souza, presented the owner's plan to expand the house to a full second story. Both the owner and architect said there was a lot of development in the neighborhood that was not consistent with the historic context of this house.

Staff reported that a permit was pulled to construct this house in 1952. The architect was A.M. Kreider of Newtonville, and the owner was Jerry C. Crowley, then by Aaron Samuels in 1955. With the exception of electrical and plumbing permits, no other

alterations appear to have been made to the building. This house is part of the 20th century multiple resource survey, which identified this style and period as notable for its architectural character for the period 1950 to 1954 and for community planning. It was noted as one of the largest architecturally cohesive neighborhoods of this style in Newton. Staff recommends this house preferably preserved for historic context and architectural integrity.

Commission members discussed the merits of this surveyed property as consistent with the scale and context of this neighborhood. A member stated that the NHC was working toward respecting the scale of this area because it was coming under increased development pressure. Another member said he thought this house was worth preserving.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 197 Evelyn Road **preferably preserved** for historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house at 197 Evelyn Road **preferably preserved** for historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Chairman
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

Commission members reviewed the proposed plans for the partial demolition proposal. A Commission member asked that the architect take some language for shape and form from the neighborhood, since the current plan did not attempt to do so in his opinion. The architect for the project emphasized the ways in which he believed he did so, in retaining gable ends and using the same chimney column. The owner spoke to his family's need for more space and guest accommodations for extended family, and had site constraints that limited their expansion options. Commission members cited the loss of horizontal character of this house with the large second story, and that elevations with changes in depth or materials would improve the design. Other commission members cited the lack of defining character elements in the new design that respected the existing neighborhood context. Commission members asked whether it was possible to design a 1.5 story structure that would still meet the owner's needs in order to respect the horizontal emphasis in the neighborhood.

Armstrong made a motion to deny the waiver of the demo delay at 197 Evelyn Road.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to deny the waiver of the demo delay at 197 Evelyn Road.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Chairman
Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Len Sherman, Alternate

11 Ruane Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The contingent owner of this property, Mr. Wooding of Fast Track LLC, and his builder and engineer, requested of the Chair that this application be heard at this hearing, even though his proposal was not due to time out, because his provisional Purchase and Sale on the property expired on October 6th. The Chair asked if the potential owner waived the opportunity for abutters to hear the proposal and he said yes. Mr. Wooding presented that this house had water, mold and flooding problems and that it had to come down. He also said that this house was not as well maintained as others in the neighborhood and that it had been rented for a long time.

Staff reported that this brick, split-level home was built in 1951 by Leo B. Margolian and first owned by Joseph Rosenshine, a lawyer. He and his wife still lived there until at least 1985. A rear addition was constructed in 1972. A rear addition for a home business was permitted in 1995 when the house was owned by Sandra Vanlegun. A rear porch addition was also rebuilt as enclosed housing space, and an insurance claim for damage to the home was filed in 2010 under her ownership as well. This house is similar in design, orientation, materials and massing to others of this design in the immediate neighborhood, and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members said that they thought the neighborhood was contextually intact in general, and that the existing ranches were one-story and well designed. Another member said she thought the other ranch houses had respectfully maintained their homes and that the same could be done here. The provisional owner, though told the Commission could not review replacement plans at this hearing, distributed an image of a French Chateausque replacement structure and asked the Commission if it was deemed to be an approvable replacement. The Commission told him the image he provided did not appear to be in keeping with the rest of the neighborhood, but in four months' time he could return with a completed application and it would be reviewed.

Grissom made a motion to find the house at 11 Ruane Road preferably preserved for historic context.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on September 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house at 11 Ruane Road preferably preserved for historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Chairman		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Peter Dimond, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Len Sherman, Alternate		

Administrative:

Members in attendance at the previous hearings in July and August approved the minutes from the July and August hearings.

Katy Hax Holmes
Commission Staff

Approved